

*Report on*  
*Kazan State Technological University*  
*(KSTU)*  
*Russian Federation*

*November 30 - December 5, 2003*

# **SALZBURG SEMINAR**

**UNIVERSITIES PROJECT**  
**VISITING ADVISORS PROGRAM**



**The Universities Project of the Salzburg Seminar  
Visiting Advisors Program**

**Summary Report of the Visit to the  
Kazan State Technological University (KSTU)  
Russian Federation  
November 30 - December 5, 2003**

**Team Members:**

**Brigitte Winklehner** (Team Leader), President, Eurasia-Pacific Uninet for Austrian Universities

**Robin Farquhar**, Professor and Former President, Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada

**Helene Kamensky**, Director, Russian Higher Education Programs, Salzburg Seminar, Austria

We would like to begin by recalling the mission of our visit to Kazan and the Kazan State Technological University. The Visiting Advisors Program (VAP) of the Salzburg Seminar is a program of intensive interactions with leaders of selected institutions of higher education in Russia and in Eastern Europe, following their participation in a session of the Universities Project at the Salzburg Seminar. Visits by university educators and administrators from North America, Europe and other parts of the world allow participants to engage in dialogue about issues of common concern to higher education and provide an international perspective to challenges faced by the universities as they redefine relationships with governments and are integrated into the global intellectual community. Members of the Visiting Team come to share their experience on issues related to higher education reform as those issues are identified by the host institution.

The members of this Team are especially grateful to the Rector, the Vice Rectors, administration, faculty, and staff of Kazan State Technological University (hereafter referred to as KSTU or the University) for their warm and gracious hospitality during the visit. While we did not perform an in-depth investigation of the University operation, because this was not our assigned role, we did come to understand many of the more salient issues at KSTU and to meet and interact with the people who study and work there. We hope that our observations and recommendations will prove helpful as the University seeks to achieve the most efficient performance in the field of education and research.

The Team members of the Visiting Advisors Program arrived in Kazan on the 30<sup>th</sup> of November 2003 and were given a very warm welcome by the Department of International Relations. We were invited to dinner that evening with Vice Rector German Diakonov. On the following day, we had the pleasure of meeting the Rector,

who presented us with a very comprehensive view of the history, structure and governance of the University.

On the same morning, we had the first discussion session with the Vice Rectors, in which questions of different models of the university governance were raised, as well as the problems implementing the Bologna Process and the European Credit Transfer System, questions of funding, tuition fees, and mobility of faculty.

## **1. Academic Structure and Governance**

KSTU initiatives have provided the basis for the University to be recognized as a Federal Experimental Platform (FEP) with the objective of working out a functioning model for university complexes in the time period from 2001 to 2003.

The extensiveness of the University's activities required the government to modify the decision-making process toward optimal decentralization. The following principles for the new government system provide the basis for this change:

- division of the academic and administrative functions, freeing the Academic Council from solving current problems (these functions were passed on to the Administrative Council)
- creation of effective and transparent system of control, planning, and resources management (material, financial, personnel)
- reorganization of the Rector's office: every Vice Rector serves as head of a structural division (Faculty, college, or institute) and is in charge of a certain politic and program
- optimization of the University structure: giving more autonomy to the structural divisions by strengthening the division head's responsibility
- normative regulation of governance practice
- creation of a complex system to uphold the quality of the University, including self-assessment and assessment systems, as well as the creation of procedures to carry out research and analysis
- development of the students' self-management

The first topic chosen by our hosts for consideration concerned the management of the University, with specific reference to its administrative structure and governance mechanisms. While our discussion of this subject was wide-ranging and interesting, we shall limit our attention in this report to three subjects that seem especially important to us.

### **Board of Trustees**

First, we were pleased to learn that KSTU is among the first universities in Russia to have established a Board of Trustees, which includes about sixty industrial leaders as well as a few government officials. This body meets twice each year to consider matters related to the strategic planning and management of the University, with particular attention to its role in the economic and social development of the region. Clearly, the board enhances the institution's

relationship with and contribution to its community, and the KSTU leadership is to be commended for taking this important initiative. Indeed, we understand that it is planned to establish additional boards of trustees to work with several of the constituent institutes within the University, which will multiply the advantages of cooperation between the academic and industrial sectors – with benefits being gained in such areas as field experiences for students, further training for industrial personnel, cooperation in applied research, sharing of scientific equipment, fund-raising, and employment of graduates.

### **University Leadership at KSTU**

Secondly, we were interested in the practice of appointing to most Vice Rectoral positions scholars who have been elected as directors of their respective institutes. This approach seems sensible at the current early stage of the University's operation as a regional complex according to an experimental model, whereby several distinct organizations are amalgamated into a single composite institution. Appointing the heads of these constituent divisions as Vice Rectors of the encompassing University can be helpful in generating commitment of those in the various divisions to the parent complex, especially at this time when the institutes retain substantial operational autonomy. However, if the full potential of the regional complex model is eventually to be realized, the balance in leadership will have to shift toward the overall University level and the principal expertise and interest of the Vice Rectors will need to lie in the respective strategic areas of University management for which they are responsible (instructional programs, student affairs, research administration, financial oversight, institutional planning, external relations, etc.). It is unlikely that the requisite degree of expertise and interest in these areas of functional leadership can continue to be found within the cohort of those serving as institute directors at any particular time in the future, especially as the mobility of scholars in Russia increases and the directors of institutes start being appointed from outside of KSTU – indeed, we find it a remarkable stroke of good fortune that the current body of institute directors has produced such a competent and well-balanced team of Vice Rectors.

Moreover, it seems to us that university leadership at the Vice Rectoral level and institute direction at the subsidiary level both demand the full-time attention of hard-working managers; as the concept of the University as a regional complex develops further, it may well become unrealistic to expect that any individual could perform both of these important roles effectively at the same time. We also suspect that there is a danger of conflicting interests when one person plays both roles: as a Vice Rector, the individual must be concerned with all constituent institutes and with equitable treatment among them, but as an institute director he or she must be primarily focused on advancing the work and improving the prospects of his or her own division (including when they may be in direct competition with those of other divisions). In addition, the number of Vice Rectors required and the number of institutes to be directed will both change over time and will seldom be equivalent, which means that if Vice Rectors are appointed from among institute directors there will inevitably be some of the latter for whom no Vice Rectorships are available – thereby creating two classes of institute directors (those who serve also as Vice Rectors and those who do not), which seems to us undesirable.

For all of the above reasons, we wonder if it might be wise for the KSTU leadership to begin planning for a time when it will no longer be sensible to appoint its Vice Rectors from among the institute directors. Perhaps the next logical stage in this evolution toward a fully developed regional complex would be to try and ensure that those appointed as Vice Rectors, while no longer serving also as institute directors, nevertheless represent as wide a variety of constituent divisions as possible.

### **Internationalization**

The third subject on which we wish to comment in this section is internationalization. We were told on several occasions that there is a desire at KSTU to become more internationally engaged, especially in terms of student and faculty mobility. We fully endorse this aspiration and have three suggestions for fostering it. First, we believe that the movement of Russian universities in the directions of the Bologna Accord, the European Credit Transfer System and the production of diploma supplements will become inexorable; consequently, the sooner that KSTU can adapt these developments to its own distinctive circumstances, the better will be its chances of increasing the intensity of its international engagement. Secondly, internationalization needs to be pursued at the university-wide level and with a substantial degree of authority if it is to be successfully institutionalized; accordingly, we believe that it would be wise for the university leadership at an appropriate time to consider establishing a Vice Rectorship for international relations. And finally, foreign language competence is essential to internationalization; thus, the more KSTU can do to expand the second-language capabilities of its faculty, staff and students, the better will be its opportunities for international activity.

## **2. Technology in Higher Education**

On the second day of the visit, the Team discussed the following topics with professors at KSTU:

- quality of different national educational systems
- necessity of changes within the present system of education in the Russian Federation
- the Bologna Process
- questions of curricular development
- importance of international relations

Problems for discussion included:

- information support of educational processes (time-table, library service, students, teaching and administrative staff of the university)
- rating system of knowledge and quality evaluation
- system of the University quality
- distance learning (organization, planning, methodological basis, monitoring)
- stimulating learning, as a system of developing students' creative abilities

While these discussions tended to stray away from the proposed topic on technology, they were nevertheless useful in helping us to understand the particular strengths, challenges, and opportunities which currently characterize KSTU's position in the higher education system. Our Team was very impressed by the apparently most efficient cooperation of the University with the industry of the region and the strong connection between the University and the needs of regional structures, a connection that seems to have a long history. We regarded the following facts as very positive:

- the important role of the Board of Trustees and the existence of more than 350 contracts with the industry
- the very efficient equipment of the University computers
- the excellent and very rich library and the change of the catalogue system to a computerized system
- the criteria for evaluation of teaching and ranking at the University
- the system of quality assurance within the University
- the premium reward system of publications by scientists
- the salary system that rewards young teachers
- the student-teacher ratio
- internships for students within industrial plants
- career services for graduates (alumni of the University)

Under this heading, our Team would like to offer the following suggestions:

- The University could consider the possibilities and chances of implementing distance learning elements within the Russian Federation and abroad
- The mobility of the faculty might be increased through strengthened collaboration with other institutions in Russia, North America, and Europe
- The University might seek additional funds for internationalization activities such as: office of international relations, number of staff, exchange of faculty, development of joint curricular and joint research projects with partners abroad, etc.

### **3. The Role of the University in Civil Society**

The University's objective is to enable people to develop their intellectual, cultural, and moral status; to receive higher education and qualification in accordance with their abilities, knowledge, and expectations. It provides diversity and high quality of education and it improves professional mobility.

A high level of morals and ethics is not only important in the training of specialists and preparing them for practical activity, it is a condition of successful educational work at the University.

Educational work is a purposeful, systematic and co-coordinated activity of the teaching and administrative staff and all the departments of the University, which aims at forming and developing the high moral, practical, and civil mentality of the

students. Shortcomings in educational work lead to decreasing the effects of this teaching.

The tasks of educational work include:

- forming a scientific world perspective as the basis of practical thought, to develop cognitive interest and the striving for cognitive search;
- directing students toward a humanistic world perspective, to cultivate the students' needs for mastering common values and national culture, to form aesthetic values, to strive for the creation and augmentation of cultural wealth;
- developing professional skills, to inculcate the habit of work as the most important objective and moral value, to develop initiative and creative search, purposefulness, competitive ability in the professional sphere and in all other spheres of life;
- educating a student as an individual and a citizen, to inculcate an active position in life and civil responsibility, to form a political position, national self-consciousness, civic spirit and patriotism, to develop respect of law and order;
- cultivating a healthy life, positive attitude toward family life, to bring up a new generation in the spirit of humanity and democracy.

The Department of Education and Training was organized in KSTU for achieving these tasks. This department coordinates the planning of education and training and its implementation at all the levels of the University.

Problems for discussion included:

- Development of relationship with other institutes;
- Forming of Advisory Committee for rendering help in the process of reforms.

The third day of the visit was devoted to the topic "The role of the University in the Emerging Civil Society." The Team engaged in very intensive and fruitful discussions on extra-curricular activities for students that can be compared with the offerings for students in Western Europe and Canada.

The curriculum for the formation of a sense of civic responsibility in students is divided into compulsory and optional subjects. We regarded as very positive that the University is developing new standards for this very important element within each curriculum.

We also noticed a very thoughtful policy toward the issue of drop-outs and what could be done to solve this problem (which affects all educational institutions, not only in Russia). It seems very positive that KSTU gives students the chance to obtain supplementary qualifications within the field of double-degrees studies.

It is another proof of the most efficient cooperation with companies that the University provides a special institute of professional re-training for companies in the area.

The Team was most impressed by the general harmonious and peaceful communal living of the various ethnic groups and religions in Kazan and the Tatarstan Republic

and the important role that cross-cultural religious study seems to have at KSTU, even to the extent of being integrated as an optional field of study in the curriculum.

#### **4. Other Comments**

- When we met with faculty and student members, who admittedly may not have been truly representative, we were struck by the considerable skepticism expressed by some about the values of globalization and their concern that it may jeopardize the distinctive quality of Russian higher education system. To the extent that this view is typical, we view it as unfortunate – both because globalization is inevitable, and because it can be a means of improving Russian universities as well as conveying their strengths to those elsewhere. In a related vein, the University's leaders acknowledge the difficulty in motivating faculty members to creatively employ information and communication technologies in their teaching. However, they correctly recognize that this may be largely a generational problem which should subside over time as the population of younger faculty members increases.
- We were impressed by KSTU's comprehensive and thorough system of performance evaluation (with a requirement that students achieve a score of at least thirty-six out of a possible sixty for performance during the term before qualifying to write the end-of-course examination which accounts for the final forty points in the evaluation scheme), the system of assessing the teaching performance of faculty members through evaluations by both students and colleagues, and the establishment of a central administrative office to lead the Institution's quality assurance function. To further strengthen this admirable focus, we suggest that KSTU take the initiative to form a "benchmarking club" of similar institutions through which best practices in university quality assurance can be shared.
- We found the curricular structure of academic programs at the University to be well balanced and carefully conceived. It enables students to progress through their programs together as continuing cohorts, which enhances both social support and character development (thus contributing to KSTU's emphasis on fostering civil society). It provides for students to engage equally in classroom instruction and private study (at their homes, in the library, and via their computers). It also includes extensive opportunities for the application of theoretical learning to practical situations in industrial settings, which is essential in a good technological university. The end result is a graduate of which the institution can be proud – one who is academically knowledgeable, professionally competent, and independently responsible.

#### **5. Concluding Remarks**

The Rector and his team have provided the University with a very strong position in the economic and industrial structure and background of the Tatarstan Republic. They can guarantee employment to most of their graduates and also offer re-training in fields of teaching and research that are of utmost importance in times of rapid technology development. We are therefore confident that KSTU will manage to claim an excellent position in the rating of all technical universities in the Russian Federation. We wish only further good decisions for the structure and governance at



KSTU, even in difficult times of transition and change in the society, and therefore also in any field of education.

The hospitality provided to the Visiting Team by the University was overwhelmingly generous. Our hosts devoted an enormous amount of time and effort to provide for a fruitful and productive meeting and memorable time in Kazan. For all of this and for the warmth and compassion of the Vice Rectors and staff, the Team wishes to most sincerely thank the Rector and his team.

**Schedule:**

<b>Sunday, 30 November</b>			
<b>Time, event</b>	<b>KSTU representatives</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Place</b>
VAP Team arrivals			
19:30 Dinner	German Diakonov, interpreter		Restaurant of the “Safar” Hotel
<b>Monday, 1 December</b>			
9:00 Departure to KSTU	Andrey Vasilyev, interpreter		
9:30 – 10:30 Meeting with the Rector	All the Team	Meeting. Presentation of the KSTU. Discussion of the general issues of the program, general review of the week schedule, main issues to be discussed, problem list.	Rector’s office (block A)
10:30 – 11:00 Coffee break Photo			Small office of the Academic Council KSTU (block A)
11:00 – 12:30 “A” working group session.	All the Team Leader Sergey Diakonov	Academic Structure and Governance within the University	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
12:30 – 13:30 Lunch	German Diakonov, interpreter		Refectory of KSTU
14:00 – 15:30 “A” working group session. continue	All the Team Leader German Diakonov	Academic Structure and Governance within the University	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
15:30 – 16:00 Coffee break			Small office of the Academic Council KSTU (block A)
16:00 – 17:0	All the Team Leader Sergey Diakonov	Academic Structure and Governance within the University	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU (block A)
17:00 – 18:00 Debriefing meeting			Hotel “Safar”
18:30 Welcome dinner	All the Team		Restaurant of the “Safar” Hotel
<b>Tuesday, 2 December</b>			
8:30 Departure to KSTU	Andrey Vasilyev, interpreter		
9:00 – 10:15 Meeting with Senior administrators, Deans, representatives of the faculties, students.	Representatives of the KSTU administrations, faculties, students.	Discussion of the KSTU problems.	Large office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block A)
10:15 – 10:45 Coffee-Break Press, TV			Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
10:45 – 12:30 “B” working group session.	All the Team Leader Alexander Kochnev	Technology in Higher Education	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
12:30 – 13:30 Lunch	Alexander Kochnev, interpreter		Refectory of KSTU

14:00 – 16:00 “B” working group session. continue	All the Team Leader Alexander Kochnev	Technology in Higher Education	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
16:00 – 18:00 Cultural program	Andrey Vasilyev, interpreter	Sightseeing, visit to the Kazan Kremlin	
18:00 – 19:00 Debriefing meeting			Hotel “Safar”
19:00 Dinner	Alexander Kochnev, interpreter		Restaurant
<b>Wednesday, 3 December</b>			
8:30 Departure to KSTU	Andrey Vasilyev, interpreter		
9:00 – 10:30 “C” working group session.	All the Team Leader Ludmila Abutalipova	The Role of the University in the Emerging Civil Society.	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
10:30 – 11:00 Coffee-Break			Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
11:00 – 12:30 “C” working group session. continue	All the Team Leader Ludmila Abutalipova	The Role of the University in the Emerging Civil Society.	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
12:30 – 13:30 Lunch	Ludmila Abutalipova, interpreter		Refectory of KSTU
14:00 – 15:00	All the Team Leader Ludmila Abutalipova	The Role of the University in the Emerging Civil Society.	Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
15:00 – 18:00 Cultural program	Andrey Vasilyev, interpreter	Visit to the Raif Men’s Monastery	
18:00 – 19:00 Debriefing meeting			Hotel “Safar”
19:00 Dinner	Ludmila Abutalipova, interpreter		Restaurant
<b>Thursday, 4 December</b>			
8:30 Departure to KSTU	Andrey Vasilyev, interpreter		
9:00 – 12:30 Work above the report	German Diakonov Andrey Vasilyev		Small office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
12:30 – 13:30 Lunch	Valery Alyaev, interpreter		Refectory of KSTU
14:00 – 15:30	All the Team Leader – German Diakonov	Oral presentation of the preliminary report to the Rector	Large office of the Academic Council KSTU, (block “A”)
15:30 – 18:30 Free time			
18:30 Farewell dinner	All the Team		Restaurant of the “Safar” Hotel
<b>Friday, 5 December</b>			
Team Departures			

## Visiting Team:

<p><b>Brigitte WINKLEHNER</b>          Brigitte Winklehner is President of the Eurasia-Pacific Uninet, an international network in the European, East and Central Asian and Pacific regions for Austrian universities, universities for applied sciences and other educational institutions, which she organized in 2000 on behalf of the Austrian Ministry for Education, Science, and Culture. She is vice president of the Advisory Board for Austrian Universities of Applied Sciences, chair of the National Socrates/Erasmus Advisory Council, member of the Board of Trustees of the Austrian Broadcasting Company and head of the Higher Education Policy Council for the federal province of Salzburg. She holds a Ph.D. in romance languages and literature from the University of Innsbruck. Dr. Winklehner is a frequent participant of Salzburg Seminar Universities Project symposia.</p>	
<p><b>Robin FARQUHAR</b>          Robin Farquhar is professor of public policy and administration and served as president of Carleton University, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada from 1989 to 1996. He was vice chancellor and president of the University of Winnipeg, Manitoba from 1981 to 1989, and has chaired the Canadian Bureau for International Education. Dr. Farquhar is former president of both the Canadian Society for the Study of Education and the Commonwealth Council for Educational Administration. He received B.A. (honors) and M.A. degrees in English from the University of British Columbia and a Ph.D. in education administration from the University of Chicago, Illinois, USA. Dr. Farquhar is a member of the Universities Project Advisory Committee.</p>	
<p><b>Helene KAMENSKY</b>          Helene Kamensky is director of Russian Higher Education Programs at the Salzburg Seminar where she formerly served as Russian program coordinator for the Universities Project. Before joining the Salzburg Seminar, Dr. Kamensky served as an adjunct professor of philosophy and Russian studies at the Institutes of Philosophy at the University of Salzburg and the University of Vienna. Previously, Dr. Kamensky was research fellow at the Institute of Scientific Theory at the Salzburg International Research Center. From 1985 to 1989 she was dean of the Faculty of Foreign Languages at Novosibirsk State Pedagogical University in the Russian Federation, where she previously served as associate professor and senior lecturer in the department of philosophy. She holds a Ph.D. in philosophy from the department of logic and epistemology at the Russian Academy of Sciences, which was authenticated by the University of Salzburg, Austria in 1993.</p>	

## **THE UNIVERSITIES PROJECT OF THE SALZBURG SEMINAR**

Universities throughout the world are undergoing systemic changes in their governance, academic design, structure, and mission. From 1998 to 2003, the Salzburg Seminar's Universities Project focused on higher education reform in Central and East Europe, Russia, and the Newly Independent States as universities in these regions redefined their relationships with governments and try to become more integrated into the global intellectual community.

The Universities Project was a multi-year series of conferences and symposia convening senior representatives of higher education from the designated regions with their counterparts from North America and West Europe. Discussion in the Project's programs focused on the following themes:

- University Administration and Finance
- Academic Structure and Governance within the University
- Meeting Students' Needs, and the Role of Students in Institutional Affairs
- Technology in Higher Education
- The University and Civil Society

### **OBJECTIVES**

Universities and other institutions of higher learning are seeking to reshape themselves in ways that will prepare them more fully for the twenty-first century. Even as these institutions are considering extensive systemic changes in their academic design, structure, and mission, all desire autonomy in governance and in their intellectual life. Accordingly, the Universities Project aimed to promote the higher education reform process by inviting senior administrators to participate in conferences and symposia concerning issues of university management, administration, finance, and governance.

### **THE VISITING ADVISORS PROGRAM (VAP)**

The Salzburg Seminar launched this enhanced aspect of the Universities Project in the autumn of 1998. Under this program, Teams of university presidents and higher education experts visit universities in Central and East Europe and Russia at the host institutions' request to assist in the process of institutional self-assessment and change. By the end of the current phase of the Program in June 2004, more than seventy VAP visits will have taken place at universities in Central and East Europe and in Russia. The addition of the Visiting Advisors Program brought to the Universities Project an applied aspect and served to enhance institutional and personal relationships begun in Salzburg.

The Salzburg Seminar acknowledges with gratitude the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation and the W.K. Kellogg Foundation, which provided funding for the Universities Project and the Visiting Advisors Program respectively.

## FOR MORE INFORMATION

For more information regarding the Salzburg Seminar's Visiting Advisors Program, the Universities Project, and Salzburg Seminar programs, please contact one of the Seminar's offices below.

Salzburg Seminar  
Schloss Leopoldskron  
Box 129  
A-5010 Salzburg, Austria

Telephone: +43 662 839830  
Fax: +43 662 839837

Email: [info@salzburgseminar.org](mailto:info@salzburgseminar.org)

Salzburg Seminar  
The Marble Works  
P.O. Box 886  
Middlebury, VT 05753 USA

Telephone: +1 802 388 0007  
Fax: +1 802 388 1030

Salzburg Seminar website: [www.salzburgseminar.org](http://www.salzburgseminar.org)